

TAKE-HOME NOTES:

Risk assessment and management of violence in general adult psychiatry

Dr Fiona Toal, Professor Paul Mullen and Professor James Ogloff

In Section 1 we considered whether mental illness is associated with an increased risk of violence. We looked at two main ways that this question has been investigated:

1. studies of rates of violence within those with mental illness
2. studies of rates of mental illness within those known to have committed a violence offence.

Unfortunately, current studies vary significantly in the definition of violence, the inclusion of those who are hospitalised, and the comparison with various controls groups.

However, the overwhelming evidence continues to point to an increase in violence within populations with mental illness specifically in those with substance abuse, personality disorder or psychopathy and psychotic disorders.

In Section 2 we considered how violence in patients with mental illness results from many complex interacting variables:

- Contemporary approaches to risk assessment and management take into account both **static** and **dynamic** risk factors, thus considering an individual's past, present, and future risk factors that might affect the likelihood of him or her becoming violent.
- Most important amongst these for clinicians are those variables which are **dynamic** and subject to change (i.e. they can change over time and they can be influenced by treatment or other intervention).
- The identification of dynamic factors can guide individual management and treatment plans.

In section 3 we considered the two main models for risk assessment:

- **Actuarial risk assessment**
 - These tools can assist in assessment and help to identify those groups at high risk.
 - These instruments focus on historical factors and are less clinically useful when attempting to develop strategies to manage risk.
- **Structured professional judgment**
 - These tools take into account both static and dynamic factors and combine current clinical evaluation with a review of historical risk factors in a systematic way.
 - The HCR 20 reviews current risk management plans, therefore is more clinically useful in developing strategies to manage risk.
- Neither tools should replace traditional clinical assessment but are proposed to be used as an additional aide to ensure that relevant risk factors are considered in a systematic way.
- Neither tools can be used to predict at an individual level whether someone is likely to commit a violent offence. Rather, these tools should assist in identifying those high-risk subgroups in whom more resources are necessary and to ensure appropriate interventions and management strategies are considered to reduce the risk.

- The outcomes of the assessment should be shared openly with the patient and their carers and hopefully assist in highlighting the importance of their participation in the treatment and management plan.

In section 4 we examined the clinical interventions which can improve the management of risk:

- Management will require adequate assessment and treatment – focussing on compliance and engagement with services. Improved accommodation, and links to programmes to improve social interaction will improve the likelihood of engagement with treatment.
- The assessment and management of drug and alcohol misuse among those with schizophrenia is a major priority – its effective control is a prerequisite for any other management.
- Pharmacotherapy can reduce violence in those whose prior violence was linked to psychotic symptoms.
- Psychological interventions can specifically target anger control, interpersonal skills and effective self assertion.

To conclude:

- Patients with mental illness are at increased risk of violence compared to the general population. High-risk subgroups are recognisable in advance and this is greatly assisted by structured clinical assessment.
- Only a few, even in these groups, will ever commit serious acts of violence but interventions targeted at the high risk group will help to reduce serious episodes of violence.
- The ongoing prevention of future violence requires approaches that target substance misuse, control of positive psychotic symptoms, personality factors, the need for employment and/or structured activities, as well as encouraging appropriate and supportive social networks and relationships.
- This risk assessment approach is not perfect and does not increase the ability to identify a particular individual who may commit an act of serious violence, but it does allow improved management of those at higher risk.

Reflection

(1.1) What is your estimate of the rates of violence in people with schizophrenia/people with comorbid schizophrenia and substance misuse? How do you think these figures would compare with rates of violence in the general population?

(1.5) What would you estimate to be the prevalence of schizophrenia in people who have committed a violent offence?

(1.8) What has been your clinical experience with regard to mental illness and violence?

(1.10) In your estimation, do you think people with mental illness are more likely to become victims or perpetrators of violence?

(2.1) Why do you think people at risk of schizophrenia might also be more likely to commit a violent crime?

(2.3) Can you think of some examples of static and dynamic risk factors?

(2.12) In your clinical experience, which psychotic symptoms have been most frequent in patients who behave violently?

(2.16) What are your thoughts on the role of substance misuse in violent behaviour? How significant do you think its role is compared with the illness itself?

(2.21) Consider which factors may be a target of clinical intervention within your day-to-day practice.

- (3.6) What do you think might be a benefit of using actuarial risk assessment tools?
- (3.7) Which risk factors for violence would you estimate to be most consistently identified by actuarial tools?
- (3.8) What do you think might be the limitations of using actuarial tools for risk assessment?
- (3.18) What does the outcome of using actuarial or structured professional judgement tools actually tell us about each individual patient?
- (4.5) Which external motivators can you think of that might improve engagement with treatment?
- (4.7) Which interventions might you consider when treating a patient with substance misuse?

References

- Appelbaum PS, Robbins PC, Monahan J (2000) Violence and delusions. Data from the MacArthur Violence Risk Assessment. *American Journal of Psychiatry*; **157**: 566-572. [[abstract](#)]
- Arseneault L, Moffitt T, Caspi A et al (2005) Mental disorders and violence in a total birth cohort. Results from the Dunedin. *American Journal of Public Health*; **95**: 11, 2015–2021. [[full text](#)]
- Brennan PA, Mednick SA, Hodgins S (2000) Major mental disorders and criminal violence in a Danish birth cohort. *Archives of General Psychiatry*; **57**: 494–500. [[abstract](#)]
- Brunette MF, Drake RE, Xie H et al (2006) Clozapine use and relapses of substance use disorder among patients with co-occurring schizophrenia and substance use disorders. *Schizophrenia Bulletin*; **32**: 637–43. [[abstract](#)]
- Choe JY, Teplin LA, Abram KM (2008) Perpetration of violence, violent victimization, and severe mental illness: balancing public health concerns. *Psychiatr Services*; **59**(2): 153-64. [[full text](#)]
- Citrome L, Volavka J, Czobor P et al (2001) Effects of clozapine, olanzapine, risperidone and haloperidol in patients with hostility among patients with schizophrenia. *Psychiatric Services*; **52**: 1510–1514 [[abstract](#)]
- Citrome L (2007) The psychopharmacology of violence with emphasis on schizophrenia, part 1: acute treatment. *Journal of Clinical Psychiatry*; **68**(1): 163–164.
- Dean K, Moran P, Fahy T et al (2007) Predictors of violent victimization amongst those with psychosis. *Acta Psychiatrica Scandinavica*; **116**(5): 345–53. [[abstract](#)]
- Hart SD, Michie C, Cooke DJ (2007) Precision of actuarial risk assessment instruments. Evaluating the 'margins of error' of group versus individual predictions of violence. *British Journal of Psychiatry Suppl*; **49**: s60–5. [[abstract](#)]
- Hodgins S (2008) Violent Behaviour among people with schizophrenia: a framework for investigations of cause, and effective treatment and prevention. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society Biological Sciences*; **363**: 2505–2518. [[abstract](#)]
- Hodgins S, Cree A, Alderton J, Mak T (2008) From conduct disorder to severe mental illness: associations with aggressive behaviour, crime and victimization. *Psychological Medicine*; **38**(7): 975–87. [[abstract](#)]
- Kim-Cohen J, Caspi A, Moffitt TE et al (2003) Prior juvenile diagnoses in adults with mental disorder: developmental follow-back of a prospective-longitudinal cohort. *Archives of General Psychiatry*; **60**(7): 709–17. [[abstract](#)]
- Maden A (2007) *Treating Violence: A guide to risk management in mental health*. Oxford University Press. [[Amazon](#)]
- Monahan J, Steadman HJ, Silver E et al (2001) *Rethinking risk assessment: the MacArthur study of mental disorder and violence*. New York (NY) Oxford University Press. [[Amazon](#)]

Mullen PE (2006) Schizophrenia and Violence: from correlations to preventative strategies. *Advances in Psychiatric Treatment*; **12**: 239–248. [\[abstract\]](#)

Fazel S, Långström N, Hjern A, Grann M, Lichtenstein P (2009) Schizophrenia, Substance Abuse, and Violent Crime. *JAMA*; **301(19)**: 2016–2023. [\[abstract\]](#)

Schwarz C, Voltz A, Leucht S et al (2008) Valproate for schizophrenia. *Cochrane Database Syst. Rev*; **16(3)**: CD004028

Soyka M, Graz C, Bottlender R et al (2007) Clinical correlates of later violence and criminal offences in schizophrenia. *Schizophr Res*; **94(1–3)**: 89–9. [\[abstract\]](#)

Steadman HJ, Mulvey EP, Monaghan J et al (1998) Violence by people discharged from acute psychiatric facilities and by others in the same neighbourhoods. *Archives of General Psychiatry*; **55**: 1–9. [\[abstract\]](#)

Swanson JW, Van Dorn RA, Volavka J et al (2008) Comparison of antipsychotic medication effects on reducing violence in people with schizophrenia. *British Journal of Psychiatry*; **193**: 37–43. [\[abstract\]](#)

Swanson JW, Holzer CE, Ganju VK et al (1990) Violence and psychiatric disorder in the community: evidence from the Epidemiologic Catchment Area surveys. *Hosp Community Psychiatry*; **41(7)**: 761–70. [\[abstract\]](#)

Swanson JW, Swartz MS, Van Dorn RA et al (2006) A national study of violent behavior in persons with schizophrenia. *Arch Gen Psychiatry*; **63(5)**: 490–9. [\[abstract\]](#)

Swanson JW, Van Dorn RA, Swartz MS et al (2008) Alternative pathways to violence in persons with schizophrenia: the role of childhood antisocial behavior problems. *Law Hum Behav* **32**, 3, 228–40. [\[abstract\]](#)

Taylor PJ, & Gunn J (1984) Violence and psychosis. I. Risk of violence among psychotic men. *British Medical Journal (Clin Res Ed)*; **288**: 1945–9. [\[abstract\]](#)

Tengstrom A (2001) Long-term predictive validity of historical factors in two risk assessment instruments in a group of violent offenders with schizophrenia. *Nord J Psychiatry*; **55(4)**: 243–9. [\[abstract\]](#)

Vevera J, Hubbard A, Vesely A et al (2005) Violent behaviour in schizophrenia. Retrospective study of four independent samples from Prague, 1949 to 2000. *British Journal of Psychiatry*; **187**: 426–430. [\[abstract\]](#)

Volavka J (2004) Overt aggression and psychotic symptoms in patients with schizophrenia treated with clozapine, olanzapine, risperidone and haloperidol. *J Clin Psychopharmacology*; **24**: 225–228. [\[linking hub\]](#)

Wallace C, Mullen PE & Burgess P (2004) Criminal offending in schizophrenia over a 25 year period marked by deinstitutionalization and increasing prevalence of comorbid substance use disorders. *American Journal of Psychiatry*; **161**: 716–727. [\[abstract\]](#)

Walsh E, Buchanan A, Fahy T (2002) Violence and schizophrenia: examining the evidence. *British Journal of Psychiatry*; **180**: 490–5. [\[abstract\]](#)

Webster C, Douglas K, Eaves D. & Hart S (1997). HCR-20: Assessing risk for violence (version 2). Burnaby, BC: Mental Health, Law, and Policy Institute, Simon Fraser University.

Further reading

Carroll A (2007) Are violence risk assessment tools clinically useful? *Australian and New Zealand Journal of Psychiatry*; **41(4)**: 301–7. [\[abstract\]](#)

Department of Health (2007) *Best Practice in Managing Risk*. [\[PDF\]](#)

Maden A (2007) *Treating Violence: A guide to risk management in mental health*. Oxford University Press. [\[Amazon\]](#)

Mullen PE (2006) Schizophrenia and Violence: from correlations to preventative strategies. *Advances in Psychiatric Treatment*; **12**: 239–248. [\[abstract\]](#)

Mullen PE, James RP, Ogloff JD (2008) *Assessing and Managing the risks of violence towards others* (in press). New Oxford Textbook of Psychiatry (2nd edition). Oxford University Press.

Walsh E, Buchanan A, Fahy T (2002) Violence and schizophrenia: examining the evidence. *British Journal of Psychiatry*; **180**: 490–5. [\[abstract\]](#)